‘GENDER-RESPONSIVE POLICING’ INITIATIVES DESIGNED TO ENHANCE CONFIDENCE, SATISFACTION IN POLICING SERVICES AND REDUCE RISK OF VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN IN LOW AND MIDDLE INCOME COUNTRIES - A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW

IMPLICATIONS OF EVIDENCE FOR SOUTH ASIA [DECEMBER 2017]
The authors of this report are:

Shrinivas Darak (PRAYAS, Pune)
N. Sreekumaran Nair (Public Health Evidence South Asia [PHESA], Manipal University)
Bhumika T.V. (PHESA, Manipal University)
Trupti Darak (PRAYAS, Pune)
Maria Mathews (PHESA, Manipal University)
Ratheebhai V. (School of Communication, Manipal University)
Anjali Dave (Tata Institute of Social Sciences, [TISS])

Advisory Group Members are:

The Advisory group members (AGMs) of the project are Nilangi N Sardeshpande (Senior Research Consultant, SATHI, Pune, India), and Ms. Juthika Banerjee (Head of Gender Training Institute, Centre for Social Research, New Delhi, India) who is working in the field of policing related issues. Dr. Sardeshpande is a public health specialist who has worked extensively on women issues. Her doctoral dissertation was on understanding women’s access to and experiences of hysterectomy in Maharashtra. She has been associated with an NGO, SATHI-CEHAT for a long time which works on people’s right to health and health care. Ms. Banerjee is involved in managing the facilitation of internal and external training programs as well as conducting external training programmes for police officers and civil society. She also conducts external training sessions as well as training of trainers and provides pre and post training support for all trainers of police personnel. We had identified few prominent members from policing services, who are involved with policing interventions for issues on VAW, who are unofficially acting as advisory members and are ready to give support, advice and periodic feedbacks throughout the project. We identified them during the ‘National Community Policing Conclave’ held in Kerala, India on January 27-28, 2016.

We have received periodic advice from them throughout the project. The AGMs also extended support in contacting the organizations to seek the work carried out under GRP for VAW issues.

Funding

This is an independent report commissioned by the UK Department for International Development South Asia Research Hub (DFID-SARH) and funded by the Research and Evidence Division in the Department for International Development. This material has been funded by UK aid from the UK Government; however, the views expressed do not necessarily reflect the UK Government’s official policies.

Acknowledgments

We acknowledge Manipal University, Prayas and TISS Mumbai for providing logistics support to this work, the UK Department for International Development (DFID) for the financial support, EPPI-centre for technical support and PwC for coordinating. We acknowledge Sherize Merlin Sequeira, Vrindha Pari, and Divya Sussana Patil for their contribution in making the final report.
Conflicts of interest

There were no conflicts of interest in the writing of this report.

Disclaimer

The opinions expressed in this publication are not necessarily those of the UK Department for International Development, PwC, the EPPI-Centre, Manipal University, TISS or Prayas. Responsibility for the views expressed remains solely with the authors.

Citation


© Copyright

The EPPI-Centre owns the copyright for all other material on the website that it has developed, including the contents of the databases, manuals, and key wording and data-extraction systems. The authors give permission for users of the review to display and print the contents of the review for their own non-commercial use, provided that the materials are not modified, copyright and other proprietary notices contained in the materials are retained, and the source of the material is cited clearly, following the citation details provided. Otherwise, users are not permitted to duplicate, reproduce, republish, distribute, or store the review without written permission.
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Gender related indicators in South Asia ............................................................................... 10
Table 2: Contextual factors in Community Policing ........................................................................... 14
Table 3: Contextual factors in Training/Sensitization of Police ......................................................... 15
Table 4: Contextual factors in All Women Police Stations ............................................................... 17
Table 5: Contextual factors in Special Cells ..................................................................................... 19
Table 6: Contextual factors of One-Stop Centres ............................................................................. 21
ABBREVIATIONS

AGM: Advisory Group Members
ASAZA: A Safer Zambia
AWPS: All Women Police Stations
CHRI: Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative
CRC: Coordinated Response centre
DEAM: Delegacias Especializadas de Atendimiento das Mulheres
DFID: Department for International Development, UK
EC: Emergency Contraception
EPPI-Centre: Evidence for Policy and Practice Information and Coordinating Centre, UK
FATA: Federally Administered Tribal Areas
FSW: Female Sex Workers
GBV: Gender Based Violence
GDI: Gender Development Index
GEM: Gender Empowerment Measure
GII: Gender Inequality Index
GRP: Gender Responsive Policing
HIV: Human Immunodeficiency Virus
JSP: Janamaithri Suraksha Project, Kerala
KPK: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LMICs: Low and Middle Income Countries
NGOs: Non-Governmental Organizations
NIPSA: Network for Improved Policing in South Asia
NPB: National Police Bureau, Pakistan
OSC: One-Stop Centre
PHESA: Public Health Evidence South Asia
SGBV: Sexual and Gender Based Violence
SPM: Secretaria de Politicas para Mulheres
TISS: Tata Institute of Social Sciences
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAW</td>
<td>Violence against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WPS</td>
<td>Women Police Stations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

All the studied interventions seem to be applicable for implementation in South Asia and Pakistan. However, the larger issue is about effective implementation of these interventions as there appear to be several implementation challenges. Incorporating components of different interventions in a program could be useful. Gender sensitization training should be part of any GRP intervention. Implementing the interventions that can increase community participation (such as community sensitization about gender based violence, increasing community-police interactions through meetings, home visits etc.) seems to be effective in the South Asian context as it is helpful in gaining the community’s trust in policing which is largely lacking in the region. Women Police Stations are also found to be effective with proper training of women police personnel. In Pakistan, addressing gender related socio-cultural and religious factors are important for effective GRP interventions. Increasing the role of trained women in policing seems an important component for dealing with VAW. Attitudinal change training and involvement of community in policing services are important to increase gender responsiveness and accountability in policing services.

ABOUT THIS SUMMARY

This contextualization document is designed to present findings of the review in the context of the South Asian region and specifically for Pakistan. Contextualization, broadly, is a process of assessing the feasibility and generalizability of the synthesized evidence to a specific context. However, due to lack of evidence on the effectiveness of GRP interventions, the document discusses the feasibility of different GRP intervention for South Asia and Pakistan. This document also presents our approach to contextualize the current evidence coming mainly from the evaluation of different GRP programs. Since most of the reviewed literature is from South Asia (and some from Africa), the findings of the review are applicable to the South Asian context.

APPROACH

Using an ecological framework (refer to Appendix 3), we extracted the possible contextual factors from the primary studies at the level of women, family, community, institution and legal system. We included the key contextual factors particularly relevant to South Asia and Pakistan. We gathered information on other indicators which helped to provide better understanding of the background characteristics of the region and country.

SUMMARY OF CONTEXTUALIZATION ANALYSIS

The effectiveness of Gender Responsive Policing interventions, which are deeply embedded in the socio-cultural milieu, are bound to be affected by the context. Therefore, the assumption underlying the process of contextualization is that: an intervention that has been shown to be effective in one setting may turn out to be effective somewhere else, supposing it can be implemented there when contextual factors are accounted for.

In this document, we present our plan and considerations to contextualize the findings coming from the systematic review (Nair N.S. et al., 2017) to the South Asia region and particularly Pakistan. To contextualize the findings, it is essential to assess if the intervention is feasible in a given setting and if the effectiveness can be generalizable. However, due to lack of information on effectiveness of the interventions, most of the discussion in the document has been restricted to the feasibility of implementing different GRP interventions in South Asia and Pakistan. Although South Asia is
geographically, socially, and politically diverse, we focused on the contextual similarities existing across the South Asian region.

The different GRP interventions that are feasible to implement in South Asia and in Pakistan are:

*Community policing:* There is evidence from South Asia, including Pakistan, about the feasibility of implementing community policing interventions and also the usefulness of it for improving gender responsiveness. Considering the overall community’s lack of trust in policing services, community policing could be helpful to bridge the gap between the community and the police.

*Training and Sensitization:* Training seems to be essential for any GRP intervention. Considering that policing services are largely male dominated and that gender bias is extremely prevalent in the police system, training with a clear emphasis on attitude change is needed. Lack of seriousness about gender issues, lack of support from seniors and need for continuous follow-up are some of the barriers for training to be an effective GRP intervention.

*(All) Women Police Stations:* Women police stations have been established in South Asia and other parts of the world and have increased reporting of GBV cases and also increased the satisfaction of GBV survivors. However, it needs to be highlighted that it is important that women police in WPS also receive gender sensitization training in order to provide better services.

*Special police units/cells:* There is evidence of feasibility of establishing special police units/cells in South Asia region and the intervention has been accepted by people and increased the level of reporting of GBV cases. Most often, special units are situated within the police station and hence efforts are required to make the community aware of them and to address the stigma associated with visiting a police station.

*One Stop Centres:* The evidence for one stop centres mainly comes from Africa. However, the intervention could also be feasible in South Asia and in Pakistan. Providing services related to justice, health, psycho-social support at one centre could be beneficial for women. However, accessibility and availability of services and infrastructure would be important in ensuring its impact.

South Asia has a number of contextual similarities that makes the GRP interventions applicable across all the countries. Further, most of the reviewed literature is from South Asia (and some from Africa). Hence the findings of the review are applicable to the South Asian context.

In Pakistan Gender Responsive Policing is influenced by various factors including sociocultural factors, gender disparities, religious factors and infrastructural availability. These factors play an important role in the type of interventions that are being implemented and how it is received by all the stakeholders involved. In Pakistan, increasing the role of women in policing seems an important component for dealing with VAW. Attitudinal change training and involvement of community in policing services are important to increase gender responsiveness and accountability in policing services.

**STRENGTHS AND LIMITATIONS**

**STRENGTHS**

This contextual analysis summarizes the best available evidence regarding the effectiveness of gender responsive policing interventions in South Asian context, specifically for Pakistan. It will help
practitioners and policy makers in making decisions about the feasibility of different GRP interventions.

**LIMITATIONS**

Due to lack of reliable information on the effectiveness of GRP interventions, it was difficult to comment on the generalizability of different GRP interventions for South Asia and Pakistan.
1. BACKGROUND

1.1 ABOUT CONTEXTUALIZATION

The systematic review reported the synthesis of literature from low and middle income countries on design, implementation and effectiveness of different gender responsive policing interventions. However the implementation and effectiveness of GRP interventions are strongly embedded within the sociocultural, political, economic and environmental settings. Applicability and transferability are two important concepts that are addressed in the process of contextualization. **Applicability** (or feasibility) refers to whether the intervention process could be implemented in the desired local setting, irrespective of whether it will be effective or not in that setting. The leading question for policy-makers is: **Is it possible or feasible to run a particular intervention in this local setting?** (Wang et al., 2006). **Transferability** (or generalizability) comes after applicability and deals with effectiveness. The leading question for policy-makers is: supposing there were conditions for implementing the intervention in local setting, **can it achieve the same effectiveness as it did in the study settings?** (Wang et al., 2006).

This document aims to contextualize the findings of the systematic review to South Asia and particularly to Pakistan. While the contextualization process involves applicability and transferability, due to lack of evidence on the effectiveness of GRP interventions, the contextualization document would mainly focus on the applicability of GRP interventions to South Asia and particularly to Pakistan.

1.2 SOUTH ASIA: SIMILARITIES AND DISPARITIES ACROSS COUNTRIES

The countries considered in South Asia are Pakistan, Afghanistan, Maldives, India, Nepal, Myanmar and Bangladesh and the table below (see Table 1) provides information on various indicators that show the composition of the police force and some gender-based indicators that show the position of South Asia in terms of gender equality/inequality. India and Pakistan Pakistan have the highest populations among the six countries. Within the region, Maldives has highest police to population ratio. The percentage of women in police services with respect to total police force is highest in Maldives (9.31%) and lowest in Pakistan (0.64%).

To understand the situation of gender disparities, various gender based indicators are routinely calculated. The **Gender Inequality Index (GII)** (Human Development Data, 2017) is basically an indicator that measures to what extent women must catch up with men and how much disparities exist. Larger value indicates more gender inequality. South Asia as a region stands with the value 0.520 according to data of 2016, which is comparatively high to the global scenario (0.443). But among the South Asian countries, Afghanistan has the highest inequality (GII-0.667) and Maldives has the lowest (GII- 0.312). Other countries are close to the South Asian average. **Gender Development Index (GDI)** (Human Development Data, 2017) is another indicator which measures the differences between male and female achievements in terms of education, health and command over economic resources. The higher value of GDI indicates better gender development. The South Asian region has the value of 0.822 which is lower than the value for developing countries in general. Within South Asia, Bangladesh, Maldives, Myanmar and Nepal have better gender development compared to Afghanistan, India and Pakistan.
Table 1: Gender related indicators in South Asia (Data of 2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>Bangladesh</th>
<th>Maldives</th>
<th>Nepal</th>
<th>Afghanistan</th>
<th>Myanmar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total population (2015, in thousands)</td>
<td>188,924.87</td>
<td>1,311,050.53</td>
<td>160,995.64</td>
<td>409.16</td>
<td>28,513.70</td>
<td>32,526.56</td>
<td>53,897.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police-population ratio</td>
<td>1:304 *</td>
<td>1:568 **</td>
<td>1:1073 **</td>
<td>1:100**</td>
<td>1:391 NA</td>
<td>1:750 (as of 2012)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of police stations **</td>
<td>1,392</td>
<td>14,185</td>
<td>629</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strength of Police **</td>
<td>575,000</td>
<td>17,22,786</td>
<td>154,208</td>
<td>3,683</td>
<td>67,693</td>
<td>68,000 (as of 2009)</td>
<td>80,000 (as of 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of police women (%) **</td>
<td>3,700 (0.64%)</td>
<td>1,05,325 (6.11%)</td>
<td>6,853 (4.44%)</td>
<td>343 (9.31%)</td>
<td>4,525 (6.68%)</td>
<td>1,690 (2.48%)</td>
<td>Na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Development Index ###</td>
<td>0.742</td>
<td>0.819</td>
<td>0.927</td>
<td>0.937</td>
<td>0.925</td>
<td>0.609</td>
<td>Na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Inequality Index ######</td>
<td>0.546</td>
<td>0.530</td>
<td>0.520</td>
<td>0.312</td>
<td>0.497</td>
<td>0.667</td>
<td>0.374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Empowerment Measure (as of 2008) #</td>
<td>0.337</td>
<td>0.497</td>
<td>0.379</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>0.351</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inequality in education ######</td>
<td>44.4%</td>
<td>39.4%</td>
<td>37.3%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>43.9%</td>
<td>44.8%</td>
<td>19.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Strength of police Afghanistan [Source: https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/afghanistan_police.pdf]

Number of policewomen Afghanistan [source: http://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/ourwork/ourstories/afghan-women-join-police-force.html]
The Gender Empowerment Measure (UNDP, 2008) is an indicator that captures gender inequality in three key areas: the extent of women’s political participation and decision-making; economic participation and decision-making power; and the power exerted by women over economic resources. The scores of the South Asian countries are all low in comparison to the global scenario.

The indicators show that the South Asian countries are still falling behind in terms of gender equality and that much is required to be done for the holistic betterment of women’s lives.

### 1.3 GENDER RESPONSIVE POLICING IN THE CONTEXT OF PAKISTAN

Many sociocultural factors that put women at increased risk of violence are similar across South Asia, such as a patriarchy, male dominated police system, lack of trust in police, lack of representation of women in public life and lack of political will to address the issue of gender discrimination and gender-based violence. However, there are certain contextual factors that need to be considered while interpreting the usefulness of GRP interventions to Pakistan.

1. Under the 1973 Constitutional framework, policing is treated as a provincial subject in Pakistan. Each of its four provinces – Baluchistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh – has its own civilian police force with jurisdiction extending only to their own territory. Additionally, the Islamabad Capital Territory also has its own civilian police force. ("Police Reforms : Pakistan", 2016)
2. Strong presence of informal justice system, which is mostly represented by locally respected citizens (who are not politicians) and religious leaders in some parts of Pakistan (Shinwari, 2015)
4. There are more challenges faced in conflict zones such as Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK)(International Crisis Group, 2015).
5. Domestic violence is not considered a crime in Pakistan, which results in poor institutional response from legal and justice systems (Khan, A.N (n.d)).
6. There is a huge gender gap in policing, with one of the lowest proportions of women in police in South Asia.
7. There is increasing recognition to address gender responsiveness in policing services in Pakistan. Some gender sensitization reforms such as establishing women police stations, recruiting women police, introducing new legislations for protection of women, gender sensitisation training for police have been carried out in Pakistan (Sethi, 2016)

### 1.4 PURPOSE OF THIS DOCUMENT

The contextualization document describes the process through which the findings of the systematic review (Nair N.S. et al., 2017) are interpreted within the context of South Asia and particularly for Pakistan. Considering that there is currently a lack of evidence on the effectiveness of GRP interventions, contextual understanding of factors related to GRP would provide policy makers better insights on the issues of feasibility of different GRP interventions for Pakistan.
2. METHODS

2.1 APPROACH OF CONTEXTUALIZATION

We look at contextualization as a process that starts from the very beginning of the project and not just an analytical exercise starting after the findings of the review are known. The important components of this process of contextualization are:

1. We adopted the ecological model (refer to Appendix 3) to identify contextual factors at different levels such as women, family, community, institution and legal system. In the framework proposed in this review, which mainly looks at the gender responsiveness within the policing services, we have included the legal system as a separate domain which includes 1) the legal provisions for protecting the rights of women and 2) implementation of the laws related to VAW. While contextualising the findings of GRP interventions to South Asian context, certain important aspects were considered which are specific to provision and utilization of policing services, such as implementation of the law, transparency in policing services, social stigma attached with accessing policing services, gender inequality and the importance given to women’s freedom in the society etc.

2. We extracted data on contextual factors from the 36 primary studies included in the systematic review.

3. We searched for additional literature on South Asia and Pakistan to understand the broader context with respect to gender and policing.

4. Based on the available contextual information we propose our considerations for applicability of gender responsive policing interventions to South Asia particularly to Pakistan.
3. CONTEXTUALIZATION RESULTS

3.1 SUMMARY OF GRP INTERVENTIONS IN PAKISTAN

There are two papers from a single program in Pakistan called Rabta by an NGO Rozan. One report titled “Building bridges, A community-police initiative” describes the community policing initiative focused on training (gender sensitization, training the trainers, training the police), self-awareness, life skills, sensitization to gender issues and awareness of crimes against women and children. The paper reported the evaluation of the training programmes and workshops. The other paper by Khalique, 2011, titled ‘Evaluation Report, Rabta Program, Rozan’ primarily describes the evaluation of training component of Rabta program. The attitudinal change workshop designed and implemented in this program proved to be effective in creating awareness among police personal about gender issues and how to deal with them. It was found that this intervention brought about an enhanced knowledge, gender sensitization and better institutional response among both male and female police. They also had a training of the trainer program which proved to be effective. However, the program evaluation also reported several challenges such as religious and socio-cultural beliefs, that violence is a family matter and lack of sustained support (human and financial resources) and regular follow up of the program.

While only two GRP interventions coming from a single program in Pakistan were included in the systematic review, there is some mention of other interventions being implemented in Pakistan which lacked detailed explanation about the intervention and its evaluation. Since they did not fulfil the eligibility criteria, they were not included in the main report but are considered while contextualizing the findings.

It appears that there are efforts to establish all Women Police Stations (WPS) in Pakistan as a GRP intervention. As mentioned on the website of the Network for Improved Policing in South Asia (NIPSA), Women Police Stations were introduced to reduce gender disparity in policing in Pakistan (NIPSA, 2013). Recruiting more women in policing services also seems to be one of the GRP interventions adopted in Pakistan. However, currently representation of women in police is very low. There are major reservations within society and the police fraternity about including women in police services (Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative, 2010). Some reports, however, suggest that attitudes are slowly changing among the male police and they are becoming more welcoming about women joining the police force (Dhar et al., 2015). Increasing the role of women in policing seems an important component for dealing with VAW in Pakistan. (Levine, 2015).

While there appear to be some efforts to increase gender responsiveness in policing in Pakistan, there are a lot of challenges and barriers that were encountered in the implementation. It appears that there is a considerable section of society that does not believe that policing is a respectable occupation for women, meaning they become victims of abuse themselves from society and from their male counterparts (NIPSA, 2013). Women themselves prefer not to join the police force because there is a lack of women friendly infrastructure. Women always seemed to lag behind because they were rarely involved in the decision-making process (Pancio, 2014).

Overall, for effective GRP interventions, addressing sociocultural and religious beliefs about gender role, male bias towards women, low participation of women in policing, and lack of community police interaction seems important.
3.2 PRESENCE OF CONTEXTUAL INFORMATION IN THE PRIMARY STUDIES

Using the ecological framework as a base, contextual information was extracted from the primary studies reviewed and is presented as per the different GRP interventions.

COMMUNITY POLICING

Community policing is a philosophy as well as an organizational strategy which emphasizes close participation of community in policing work. Community policing as a primary intervention is described by 13 papers (George et al., 2013; RCSS, 2010; RCSS, 2011(a; b; c; d; e; f; g; h; i; j); Rozan, 2001). From these, 12 papers were from a single project “Janamaithri Suraksha Project” (JSP) in the state of Kerala, India and one paper was from Pakistan (Rabta program, Rozan). While the JSP in India was a comprehensive program to cover crimes in general, including violence against women, the program in Pakistan was specific to addressing violence against women and had a strong component of training police personnel along with engaging the community. Contextual factors mentioned in all the 12 papers from JSP (George et al, 2013; RCSS, 2010; RCSS, 2011(a; b; c; d; e; f; g; h; i; j)) in India were similar and hence were clubbed together and are presented in the table below.

Table 2: Contextual factors in Community Policing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Legal systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Janamaithri Community policing project in India (All papers combined)</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Not reported.</td>
<td>Beat officers personally visited the households. Specific efforts to increase communication with children and participate in community hygiene/cleanliness drives.</td>
<td>Establishment of a committee represented by respectable citizens (10-25 members), Ensuring representation of women and marginalized caste and tribes; Special centres to help people know about the project and interact with police</td>
<td>Local area of around 500 houses and not exceeding 3 square kilometers as ‘beat unit’. Beat office expected to be in constant touch with the community. Women police officers (assistant beat officer) to address problems of women.</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 The alphabets a,b,c,d,e,f,g,h,i,j are given to identify and distinguish the papers of JSP in references.
Community policing program in India and Pakistan is proven to be a promising intervention to increase confidence and satisfaction among women, change the behavior and attitude of the police, reduce reluctance in approaching the police station, reduce violence in terms of eve-teasing and increase reporting of the violence.

**ACCEPTABILITY OF COMMUNITY POLICING INTERVENTION IN SOUTH ASIA AND PAKISTAN**

The evidence for community policing comes from South Asia (India and Pakistan) and from programs that have been implemented in these places for a long period and hence are shown to be feasible to implement. There are also efforts to implement community policing interventions in other countries in South Asia such as Bangladesh, Nepal and Maldives. Collaboration with community for policing services could also result in increased transparency and accountability of services, which seems to be one of the important challenges in South Asia.

Community policing is one of the GRP interventions that not only tries to address the lack of gender sensitivity in the provision of policing services (through different efforts such as training and appointing more women police staff), but also tries to gain the trust of the community in policing services through increased community participation. Given the problem of a lack of the community’s trust in policing in Pakistan, this intervention can help gain that trust and improve accountability of policing services. Considering the low representation of women in police, increasing number of women in policing while implementing community policing could be important to address the issues of VAW. Gaining community’s trust is a long term process and therefore sustained resources and commitment from all the stakeholders will play important role in determining the outcome of community policing intervention.

**TRAINING/SENSITIZATION OF POLICE**

Training of police personnel seems to be a commonly used intervention for GRP and often in combination with other interventions. Five papers (Beattie et al., 2015, Punyam et al., 2012, Deloitte, 2011, UNFPA, 2008, Khalique et al., 2011) focused on training and sensitization of police personnel.
personnel, two discussed training as a part of HIV prevention initiative among FSWs while the remaining three were from the programs aimed at improving GRP. Training is effective in reducing violence against female sex workers, particularly in reducing police arrests and improving fair treatment by police. Studies report that training is successful in improving knowledge, attitude and application of knowledge to handle the cases of GBV.

ACCEPTABILITY OF TRAINING/SENSITIZATION OF POLICE AS A GRP INTERVENTION SOUTH ASIA AND PAKISTAN

It appears that training needs to be part of any GRP intervention. Considering the widespread gender bias among police personnel in South Asia, gender sensitization training that can make police personnel aware of the reasons and factors leading to violence against women seems essential. It also appears that a training curriculum, when designed in a participatory way by taking into consideration the local needs, would be more beneficial. The program implemented in Pakistan showed that providing training to change the attitude of the police personnel is feasible. However, these efforts need to be sustained to retain the effects gained by training through repeated follow-ups. Particularly in Pakistan, it was noted that when there is lack of support from senior staff, when the trained police personnel is staffed at the police station, which is not women friendly, then the effect gained due to training diminishes. Conservative beliefs of the police personnel, mainly that violence against women is a family matter, could act as a hindrance to effective training.
Table 3: Contextual factors in Training/Sensitization of Police

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Legal systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNFPA (2002)</td>
<td>Honduras</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Insensitivity to VAW due to traditional and cultural beliefs</td>
<td>Political support; Need based participatory designing of training material; Institutionalizing gender sensitive police training.</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punyam et al. (2012)</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Marginalized status</td>
<td></td>
<td>Collectivization of FSWs; creating awareness about their rights</td>
<td>Establishing communication between police and FSWs.</td>
<td>Criminalization of sex work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beattie et al. (2015)</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Lack of awareness about rights</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Collectivization and mobilization of FSWs</td>
<td>Police harassment and arrests pushed FSWs to put themselves in dangerous situations.</td>
<td>Criminalization of sex work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rozan (2011)</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Violence against women is perceived as a family matter.</td>
<td>Lack of trust in police. Lack of community police interaction.</td>
<td>Frustration among trained police because of the structural impediments in the department; lack of support from senior staff; difficulty in sustaining the change by training when posted at stations which are not women friendly; Lack of follow ups; conservative attitude of police justifying VAW using religious laws and texts; Training driven by the NGO, lack of motivation to learn.</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deloitte/UNICEF (2011)</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Training covered reasons behind social problems concerning women and children and was better</td>
<td>Awareness of legal provisions for women and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
appreciated. Involvement of voluntary police trainers.
There were six studies (Hautzinger, 1997; Perova et al., 2015; UN Women, 2011; Shekhar et al., 2006; Natarajan, 2006; Natarajan, 2005), mainly from Brazil and India, which focused on WPS as a GRP intervention. These police stations mainly handle the cases of violence against women and children. They are mostly staffed by women police. Various activities like provision of counselling and psychological support, police protection, referral and networking with other police and judicial services are carried out in WPS. The main motive for creating these police stations was for women to be able to confide to women police more than men police. The results of these six studies showed that women who assessed services at WPS were satisfied with them. Women reported a reduction in violence by husband/partner after the intervention of women police. Specialized training of women police is important for better implementation of these WPS.

WPS are well established in few countries of South Asia including India and Pakistan. But most function only in a limited way and are engaging in providing psycho-social support to women. Additionally, their geographical spread has also been limited. Awareness about these police stations in the community is also important for women to access these services. The findings reflect that women, by virtue of their gender, need not be gender responsive and hence there is need to provide gender-sensitive training to women police to handle cases of GBV. In Pakistan, where there is already a very low proportion of women in police, additional efforts would be needed to attract more women to join policing services. Empowering women police stations, ensuring adequate infrastructure, the safety of women police and no gender discrimination in the workplace is essential.
Table 4: Contextual factors in all Women Police Stations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Legal system</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shekar et al.</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Presence of full-time trained counsellor in the AWPS, with referrals to the medical and psychiatric care units of the local hospitals</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2006)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natarjan</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Prevalence of attitude of reluctance to</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Most of the officers were higher educated; availability of computer and internet; aptitude for learning new skills and interest to practice; lack of technical competence</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2006)</td>
<td></td>
<td>report to male officers with their issues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natarajan</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Resorted to AWPS as a last resort after</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Lack of capacity to conduct follow ups; Women police officers find it difficult to act more like social workers than police; Popularity of AWPS in Tamil Nadu</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2008)</td>
<td></td>
<td>exhausting all options - within the house,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Panchayat, etc. Reluctance to report to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>male officers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hautzinger</td>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Strong ties with feminist groups; minimal special training; Ingrained sexist practices among many of the women police</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1997)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perova et al.</td>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>GBV is not perceived</td>
<td>Establishment of a new ministry (SPM) triggered an increase in funding for institutions like DEAMs; The DEAMs are more accessible in urban – metropolitan settings</td>
<td>The Maria de Penha law introduced which gave an additional impetus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2015)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>as injustice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN Women</td>
<td>Brazil, Peru, Ecuador</td>
<td>Lack of women’s knowledge about their</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Other specialized services and/or institutions are located in the same building as the WPS WPS located in urban areas so not accessible to rural population</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2011)</td>
<td>and Nicaragua</td>
<td>rights</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SPECIAL CELLS/UNITS/DEPARTMENTS/SUPPORT CENTRES

The specialized police units were established as a strategy to improve the investigation and prosecution of either sexual or gender-based violence. The units are staffed by specially trained police and operate within the police system. The specialized units also provide other interventions, either stand alone or in combinations, like community policing, community awareness programs, toll-free hotlines, assistance to survivors of GBV in accessing services and police provision of EC (emergency contraception) to survivors of GBV.

*Special cells/units* seem to be effective in increasing reporting of cases, improvement in institutional responses and enhancing sensitivity among the officers. There was satisfaction in the community about the services provided in these units.

ACCEPTABILITY OF SPECIALIZED POLICE UNITS/SPECIAL CELLS AS GRP INTERVENTION TO SOUTH ASIA AND PAKISTAN

The program evaluation on specialized police units/special cells has been reported from India in South Asia region and mainly from other countries in Africa. There are no studies on this intervention from Pakistan. While overall the intervention has been reported to have a positive impact, some contextual factors reported in the articles would be important while considering its applicability for South Asia and Pakistan. In this setting, most of the time the perpetrator of violence against women is a family member or someone who is known to the victim. Bearing in mind the high societal value given to family honour, reporting a case against a family member is often difficult. Similar to the findings reported in Timor-Leste (Heilman, 2008), in Pakistan, where there is a dominant informal justice system and gender based violence is mainly perceived as a family matter, it is likely that women/family member either do not access formal justice system or may opt for an informal justice system which could be biased against women.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Legal system</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Swaine (2003)</td>
<td>Timor-Leste</td>
<td>Economic issues as a barrier to access.</td>
<td>Low reporting due to family pressure; perpetrators within family; no protection to women</td>
<td>Social stigma. Cases at initial level are handled by the informal justice system, which is mostly gender biased and patriarchal</td>
<td>Training of trainer approach to police personnel training</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keesbury et al. (2009)</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Social stigma</td>
<td>Poor response rates and illegitimate fees charged to women</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIFEM (2012)</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSESK (2002)</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Age group of women who formed victims of SGBV: 18-35 years</td>
<td>Stereotypical gender roles in the family</td>
<td>Lack of support from village panchayat</td>
<td>Involvement of NGOs as a bridge between community and police helped implementation; Provision of shelter homes by women’s organization.</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apte 2004</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>More reporting of cases by women between 25-34 years of age and who were homemakers belonging to lower middle class</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Adequate infrastructure and increased manpower and networking was necessary for further improvement in the services</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seelinger 2014</td>
<td>Kenya, Uganda, Sierra Leone, Liberia</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not Reported</td>
<td>No psychosocial support, Social Stigma, General insecurity and disruption of public transport</td>
<td>Not Reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ONE-STOP CENTRES (OSC)

OSCs are designed to meet the needs of men, women and children who have experienced physical, sexual/psychological violence and abuse. They focus on supporting the victim and his/her family on avoiding causing further harm. There are four reports that primarily described One Stop Centres (OSC) as an intervention for gender responsive policing. The studies are selected programs mainly introduced in Kenya, Zambia & Rwanda (East Africa). OSCs are seen to be effective in improving access to quality services when women can get required services at one centre.

Acceptability One-Stop Centres as GRP Intervention to South Asia and Pakistan: The evidence for one-stop centres mainly comes from Africa. However, the intervention could also be feasible in South Asia and in Pakistan. The important contextual factors that determine the effectiveness of OSC is accessibility of these centres along with round the clock availability of integrated services. Lack of awareness about the centre and social stigma could hinder the access.

Table 6: Contextual factors of One-Stop Centres

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Legal systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bernath (2013)</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Lack of awareness of existing services to deal with GBV; Economic constraints, lack of transportation. Culture of silence – social stigma</td>
<td>Lack of monitoring.</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hodari (2013)</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Representatives of women council</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Committees to fight SGBV at the village level, contribute to the project sustainability</td>
<td>Quick service delivery</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keesbury et al. (2012)</td>
<td>Zambia &amp; Kenya</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Lack of infrastructure; Integration of OSC with other services (ex in Hospital OSC) for</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Reporting Location</td>
<td>Reporting Time</td>
<td>Problem</td>
<td>Solution</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morel-Seytoux (2010)</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>Survivors reporting to the police or the hospital after hours are not being routed through ASAZA (A safer Zambia). Lack of transport, especially at night is a major challenge.</td>
<td>Coordinated Response Centres (CRCs) do not provide 24-hour services and are understaffed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This document aims to contextualize the findings of the systematic review (Nair N.S. et al., 2017) to South Asia and particularly to Pakistan. While the contextualization process involves applicability and transferability, due to lack of evidence on the effectiveness of GRP interventions, the contextualization document has mainly focused on the applicability of GRP interventions. Since most of the reviewed literature is from South Asia (and some from Africa), the findings of the review are applicable to the South Asian context. The ecological model (refer to Appendix 3) was adopted to identify contextual factors at different levels such as women, family, community, institution and legal system. Data regarding contextual factors were extracted from the primary studies included in the systematic review. Additional literature to understand the situation of gender inequality, gender development indicators and gender responsive policing reforms in South Asia and Pakistan were searched. Based on available contextual information, applicability of different GRP interventions to South Asia and particularly Pakistan are discussed in this document.

Community policing was a promising GRP intervention which increased confidence and satisfaction among women, changed the behaviour and attitude of the police, reduced reluctance in approaching the police station and increased reporting of the violence. It also gained the confidence of the community in policing services. Community policing as a philosophy has been shown to be acceptable in the South Asia region and the intervention is being implemented in the region, including in Pakistan. Given the problem of lack of community’s trust in policing in Pakistan, this intervention can help gain that trust and also improve accountability of policing services.

Training/sensitization of police is a common GRP intervention used along with other interventions. It is an important component of all the GRP interventions. Studies reported that training is successful in improving knowledge, attitude and practices of police personnel while dealing with the cases of GBV. Gender sensitive training will be helpful to address the widespread gender bias and cultural practices in police personnel in South Asia and Pakistan. But sustained efforts with repeated follow ups are needed to retain these changed attitudes in the police.

All women police station is one of the promising GRP interventions. Women were satisfied with the services provided at these police stations. There was a reduction in violence reported by women. As these WPS are already established in India and Pakistan, it is feasible GRP intervention. Limited number of women police, limited number of WPS and the invisible role of these police stations due to lack of adequate training are important factors to be considered for their effective implementation.

Special cells/units seem to be effective in increasing reporting of cases, improvement in institutional responses and enhancing sensitivity among the officers. The feasibility of this intervention has been reported from South Asia. It is essential to make the community aware of these services and reduce the stigma to come to police stations for reporting the cases of GBV, especially when the perpetrator is one of the family members.

One stop centre is a promising intervention to provide combination of services to victims of gender based violence. Centres that provide integrated services and located in hospitals are likely to be more effective. It is important that these centres are accessible to women and have good infrastructure and facilities to be able to function effectively.
Overall, the studied GRP interventions seem to be applicable in South Asia region including Pakistan. However, there are implementation challenges with each of these interventions that needs to be addressed to gain the desired results.
5. REFERENCES


Bernath, T., & Gahongayire, L. (2013). Final Evaluation of Rwandan Government and ONE UN ISANGE One Stop Centre.


N. Sreekumaran Nair, Shrinivas Darak, Bhumika T.V, Trupti Darak, Maria Mathews, L. Dayashwori Devi, Ratheebhai V, and Anjali Dave (2017) ‘Gender-responsive policing’ initiatives designed to enhance confidence, satisfaction in policing services and reduce risk of violence against women in low and middle income countries - A systematic review. London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, UCL Institute of Education, University College London.


UNIFEM. (2010). General Information Title of the initiative: “Establishment of Rwanda National Police Gender Desk” Establishment of Rwanda National Police Gender Desk What is the promising practice?


6. APPENDIX

APPENDIX 1: AUTHORSHIP OF THIS REPORT

Conflicts of interest

None declared.

Contact details

Prof. N. Sreekumaran Nair, PhD
Director, Public Health Evidence South Asia
Professor of Biostatistics & Head
Department of Statistics,
Level 6, Health Science Library, Manipal University, Manipal-576104. Karnataka, India
Phone: 0820-2922407
Email: sree.nair@manipal.edu; nsknairmanipal@gmail.com
APPENDIX 2: LIST OF COUNTRIES IN SOUTH ASIA (CONSIDERED IN THE REPORT)

SOUTH ASIA (6)

Pakistan
India
Bangladesh
Maldives
Nepal
Afghanistan

The list is based on the countries mentioned in the Request for Proposal (RfP)
APPENDIX 3: ECOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK FOR CONTEXTUALIZATION

We propose to use the ecological model to contextualize the results. Ecological model has been extensively used in research to understand violence against women occurring at different levels such as individual, family, community and society.

We propose a five-level ecological model (see Figure 1) starting from Women, Family, Community, Institutions and Legal System. This will help us understand the factors that contribute to and needs to be addressed in these domains.

Figure 1: Ecological model